Al-Farabi Kazakh National University Faculty biology and biotechnology Department of biophysics, biomedicine and neuroscience



# EDUCATIONAL-METHODICAL COMPLEX OF DISCIPLINE

### CODE

## «MUUP5303»

«Methodology and management of the training process»

Specialty «7M01504»

Course – 1 Semester –2 Number of credits – 6 Lecture – 3, 6 Seminar – 2, 4 IWSP – 6

Almaty 2023

Educational-methodical complex of the discipline is elaborated by Tormanova A.N senior lecture of the Department Biophysics, biomedicine and neurosciences, Doctor of philosophy (PhD)

Based on educational program of Specialty «7M01504 - Biology »

Considered and recommended at the meeting of the Department Biophysics, biomedicine and neurosciences from <u>August «28» 2023</u> year, protocol <u>No1</u>

Head of department

1

Kustubayeva A.M.

# SYLLABUS Sprimg semester 2023-2024 academic year Educational program ''Methodology and management of the training process»

| ID   | Independent  | work   | Number o  | f credits  |  | General                           | Independent work  |  |
|--|--|--|---|--|--|-----------------------------------|---|--|
| and name<br>of course  | of the student<br>(IWS)  |  | Lectures<br>(L)   | Practical classes  | Lab.<br>classes  | number<br>of credits              | of the student<br>under the guidance<br>of a teacher (IWST) |  |
|  |  |  |   | (PC)   | (LC)   |                                   |   |  |
| #101649<br>Methodology and<br>management of<br>the training<br>process   | 3  |  | 3,0   | 3,0  |  | 6                                 | 6   |  |
| P  | A  | CADEMIC  | INFORMA   | TION ABOU  | <b>TTHE CO</b>   | URSE                              |   |  |
| Learning<br>Format   | Cycle,<br>component  | Lecture<br>types   |   | Types<br>of practical  |  |                                   | latform final control                                       |  |
| Offline/Combined   | Professional<br>Theoretical  | Logical,   | analytical<br>iew   | Solution of s<br>and problem<br>assignments,<br>review, proje<br>assignments,<br>assignments   | ituational<br>, analytical<br>ect<br>, logical   | Verbal exam                       |   |  |
| Lecturer - (s)   | Tormanova A  | nel Nurtayev   | ma  |  |  |                                   |   |  |
| e-mail :   | Anel.Tormanova@gmail.com   |  |   |  |  |                                   |   |  |
| Phone :  | 7701387 4016   |  |   |  |  |                                   |   |  |
| Assistant - (s)  | Ashirova Zhadyra Berdimuratovna  |  |   |  |  |                                   |   |  |
| e-mail :   | Ashirova.Zhadyra@kaznu.kz  |  |   | -  |  |                                   |   |  |
| Phone :  | 8771467 0970   |  |   | URSE PRESE   |  |                                   |   |  |
|  |  | ACAL   | DEMIC COU   | UKSE PRESE   | INTATION   |                                   |   |  |
| Purpose<br>of the course:  | E  | xpected Lea  | rning Outco   | omes (LO) *  |  | Indicators of LO achievement (ID) |   |  |
| To form<br>managerial skills<br>with application<br>of management<br>methodology and<br>state obligatory<br>standards in the |  | To comply with the requirements of the state obligatory<br>adard in the process of implementation of the educational<br>cess |   |  | bcess of implementation of the educational course volume for subjects<br>1.2. Select and apply criteria<br>evaluation and testing<br>knowledge in the organization<br>implementation of the teaching |                                   |   |  |
| organization and<br>management and<br>preparation of the<br>educational and<br>training process                              |  |  | <ul> <li>2.1. Identify<br/>inform<br/>training</li> <li>2.2. Evaluate<br/>objectiv<br/>accorda</li> </ul> | key strategic objectives to<br>the current annual plan for<br>process<br>e and adapt current tactical<br>res of thematic lessons in<br>nce with the strategic goals<br>l in the standard |  |                                   |   |  |
|  | 3. Develop training programs in accordance with the requirements of the standard and the development of methods for managing the educational process |  |   |  | 3.1. Identify<br>thematic<br>account<br>curricul   | subject and cross-                |   |  |

|                       | 4. To propose ways to improve the methodology of learning process management  | <ul> <li>3.2. Определять степень нагрузки и длительность усвоения тематических разделов по предметам в зависимости от возраста и уровня подготовленности учащихся в ходе составления учебной программы</li> <li>4.1. Evaluate practical tools to practically improve the effectiveness of instructional management</li> <li>4.2. Determine what visual, technical tools and techniques are needed to support the learning process</li> </ul> |
|-----------------------|---|--|
|                       | 5. Apply business approaches to managing the learning process:<br>analysis, goal setting, planning, decision making, organization<br>and control, motivation and delegation, marketing  | <ul> <li>5.1. Practical application of business principles in the organization of the educational process</li> <li>5.2. Planning objectives and achievable results for each level of management</li> </ul>   |
| Prerequisites         | Pedagogics, Psychology  | management   |
| Postrequisites        |   | g Biology  |
| Learning<br>Resources | <ul> <li>Pedagogy, Psychology, Theoretical Biology, Methods of Teaching Biology</li> <li>Literature: main, additional.         <ol> <li>«Oб утверждении государственных общеобязательных стандартов образования для всех уровней образования» Приказ Мин-ва образования и науки PK от 31.10.2018. 604</li> <li>O6 Образовании – Закон PK от 27.07.2017 года № 319-Ш</li> <li>Приложение №7 к Постановлению Правительства PK от 13.05. 2016 года №292</li> <li>Базавлуцкая Л.М. Педагогический менеджмент: учебное пособие / Челябинск: Изд ЗАО «Библиотека А. Миллера», 2017 97 с</li> <li>Гончаров М.А. Основы менеджмента в образовании. учебное пособие / — 3-е изд. стер. — М. : КНОРУС, 2016. — 476 с</li> <li>Садвакасова З.М. Педагогический менеджмент. Учебное пособие. 2-2е изд.доп Алматы, 2012 187 с.</li> <li>Рыблова А.Н. Технология управления образовательным процессом в системе непрерывного образования. Учебно-методическое пособие – Саратов: Издательски центр «Наука», 2009. – 96 с</li> <li>Академическая политика КазНУ им. аль-Фараби – текущий вариант</li> </ol></li></ul> <li>Professional scientific databases         <ul> <li>http://cyberleninka.ru/</li> <li>http://cyberleninka.ru/</li> <li>http://cyberleninka.ru/</li> <li>http://students-library.com/library/read/60508-metody-priemy-sredstva-organizacii-i-upravl pedagogiceskim-processom</li> <li>http://usu.kz/upravlenie_uchebnym_protsessom.php</li> <li>http://student39.ru/ector/Metodypriemy_obucheniya/</li> </ul> </li> |  |

| Academic      | The academic policy of the course is determined by the Academic Policy and the Policy of Academic  |
|---------------|--|
| course policy | Integrity of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University.   |
|               | Documents are available on the main page of IS Univer.   |
|               | Integration of science and education. The research work of students, undergraduates and doctoral students  |
|               | is a deepening of the educational process. It is organized directly at the departments, laboratories, scientific   |
|               | and design departments of the university, in student scientific and technical associations. Independent work   |
|               | of students at all levels of education is aimed at developing research skills and competencies based on  |
|               | obtaining new knowledge using modern research and information technologies. A research university  |
|               | teacher integrates the results of scientific activities into the topics of lectures and seminars (practical) classes,  |
|               | laboratory classes and into the tasks of the IWST, IWS, which are reflected in the syllabus and are  |
|               | responsible for the relevance of the topics of training sessions and assignments.  |
|               | Attendance. The deadline for each task is indicated in the calendar (schedule) for the implementation of the   |
|               | content of the course. Failure to meet deadlines results in loss of points.  |
|               | Academic honesty. Practical/laboratory classes, IWS develop the student's independence, critical thinking,   |
|               | and creativity. Plagiarism, forgery, the use of cheat sheets, cheating at all stages of completing tasks are   |
|               | unacceptable.  |
|               | Compliance with academic honesty during the period of theoretical training and at exams, in addition to the  |
|               | main policies, is regulated by the "Rules for the final control", "Instructions for the final control of the   |
|               | autumn / spring semester of the current academic year", "Regulations on checking students' text documents  |
|               | for borrowings".   |
|               | Documents are available on the main page of IS Univer.   |
|               | Basic principles of inclusive education. The educational environment of the university is conceived as a   |
|               | safe place where there is always support and equal attitude from the teacher to all students and students to   |
|               | each other, regardless of gender, race / ethnicity, religious beliefs, socio-economic status, physical health of   |
|               | the student, etc. All people need the support and friendship of peers and fellow students. For all students,   |
|               | progress is more about what they can do than what they can't. Diversity enhances all aspects of life.  |
|               | All students, especially those with disabilities, can receive counseling assistance by phone / e- mail   |
|               | Anel.Tormanova@gmail.com; or via video link in MS Teams <i>http://surl.li/ovmlq</i>  |
|               | <b>Integration MOOC</b> (massive open online course). In the case of integrating MOOC into the course, all students need to register for MOOC. The deadlines for passing MOOC modules must be strictly observed. |
|               | students need to register for MOOC. The deadlines for passing MOOC modules must be strictly observed<br>in accordance with the course study schedule.  |
|               | <b>ATTENTION!</b> The deadline for each task is indicated in the calendar (schedule) for the implementation of   |
|               | the content of the course, as well as in the MOOC. Failure to meet deadlines results in loss of points.  |
|               | the content of the control, as well as in the WOOC. Failure to meet deadness results in loss of points.  |

| Score-ra<br>achieven | 0 1                             | n of assessment o    | of accounting for educational                  | Assessment Methods   |                                   |  |  |
|----------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------|--|--|-----------------------------------|--|--|
| Grade                | Digital<br>equivalent<br>points | points,<br>% content | Assessment according to the traditional system | Criteria-based assessment is the process of c<br>with expected learning outcomes based on<br>formative and summative assessment.   |                                   |  |  |
| А                    | 4.0 _                           | 95-100               | Great  | <b>Formative assessment is</b> a type of assessment that is carried out in the course of daily learning activities. It is the current measure of progress. Provides an   |                                   |  |  |
| A-                   | 3.67                            | 90-94                | -  | daily learning activities. It is the current i<br>operational relationship between the student<br>determine the capabilities of the student, ide   | and the teacher. It allows you to |  |  |
| B+                   | 3.33                            | 85-89                | Fine   | <ul> <li>best results, timely correct the educational process for the teacher. The performance of tasks, the activity of work in the classroom during lectures seminars, practical exercises (discussions, quizzes, debates, round tables laboratory work, etc.) are evaluated. Acquired knowledge and competencies are assessed.</li> <li>Summative assessment - type of assessment, which is carried out upon completion of the study of the section in accordance with the program of the course. Conducted 3-4 times per semester when performing IWS. This is the assessment of mastering the expected learning outcomes in relation to the descriptors. Allows you to determine and fix the level of mastering the course fo a certain period. Learning outcomes are evaluated.</li> </ul> |                                   |  |  |
| В                    | 3.0                             | 80-84                |  | Formative and summative assessment   | Points % content                  |  |  |
| B-                   | 2.67                            | 75-79                | -  | Activity at lectures   | 0                                 |  |  |
| C+                   | 2.33                            | 70-74                |  | Work in practical classes  | 7*6=42                            |  |  |
| С                    | 2.0                             | 65-69                | Satisfactorily                                 | Independent work   | 20+30=50                          |  |  |
| C-                   | 1.67                            | 60-64                |  | Design and creative activity   | 8                                 |  |  |
| D+                   | 1.33                            | 55-59                |  | Final control (exam)   | 40                                |  |  |
| D                    | 1.0                             | 50-54                |  | TOTAL  | 100                               |  |  |
| FX                   | 0,5                             | 25-49                | Unsatisfactory                                 | 1  |                                   |  |  |
| F                    | 0                               | 0-24                 |  |  |                                   |  |  |

| A week  | Topic name   | Number<br>of hours | Max.<br>ball |
|---------|--|--------------------|--------------|
|         | MODULE 1 Background and general provisions in the management of the training proc  | ess                |              |
| 1       | L 1.Introduction. Pedagogical management - business processes and communications.<br>Education and upbringing - the main goals of the methodology of educational process<br>management. Criteria and principles of selection of the content of the educational process -<br>as part of the development of management methodology                                   | 1                  |              |
|         | <b>PC 1.</b> Principles of humanization, integration and formation of creative personality as a component of the content of general education - general cultural values and competences. The concept of the function "management". The main stakeholders of the process. The principle of building a risk map and models of an ideal learning process.             | 2                  | 6            |
| 2       | L 2. State Common Core Learning Standards. Detailed analysis and comments.<br>Technology of management of the general education process.   | 1                  |              |
|         | <b>PC 2.</b> General Provisions of the GOS in order to organize the educational process. Structural and functional components for process management. Objectives of the Management.  | 2                  | 6            |
| 3       | L 3 Modular system of educational process organization: goals and objectives. Prospects and achievements. Pedagogical analysis   | 1                  |              |
|         | <b>PC 3.</b> Experience of application of the modular system of educational process organization. Goal setting and mission.  | 2                  | 6            |
|         | <b>IWS P 1.</b> Consultation on ISW implementation of the topic: "Modern requirements for the choice of methods of teaching biology" - Make the main conclusions on the passed material of module 1. To express a view on the current state of biology teaching processes: advantages and disadvantages based on facts and examples from their personal experience | 1                  | 4            |
| 4       | L 4. Pedagogical technologies and collaborative ways of learning. Planning   | 1                  |              |
|         | <b>PC 4.</b> Information content and how to manage information as part of the learning process.<br>Components of planning. Basic rules of planning.  | 2                  | 6            |
| 5       | <ul> <li>#12 font,</li> <li>2) with the obligatory indication of the sources of information worked out</li> <li>3) Anti-plagiarism check of at least 55-60%</li> <li>L 5. Motivation for self-discovery as part of the learning process. Intensive methods and</li> </ul>  | 1                  |              |
|         | means of guidance and control. Decision making   |                    |              |
|         | <b>PC 5.</b> Processes of decision preparation. Principles in developing solutions. "Kaleidoscope" thinking, role-playing and internships, and real-life experiences   | 2                  | 6            |
|         | <b>IWST 2.</b> Colloquium - discussion on the topic:<br>"Historical background to the creation of standards on the methodology of educational process<br>management".  | 1                  | 4            |
|         | MODULE 2 Components of learning management   |                    |              |
| 6       | L 6. Expected learning outcomes as part of the management of the learning process on the example of the discipline "Biology". Organization of training   | 1                  |              |
|         | <b>PC 6.</b> Actual methods and ways of teaching in the subject "Biology" mandatory to achieve the expected results. What is necessary for the organization of innovative learning? What core competencies should an organization possess for successful implementation of the learning process.   | 2                  | 6            |
| 7       | IWST 3. Consultations on the implementation of IWS 2         L 7. Delegation of authority - basic principles. Model of "three-step" algorithm of task         delegation   | 1                  |              |
|         | <ul> <li>delegation.</li> <li>PC 7. Is the ability to set, control the execution of tasks an acquired skill or a natural talent?</li> <li>Punishment and Stimulation are equal tools of effective management. Evaluation of manager's performance, feedback is the key to finding problematic issues.</li> </ul>   | 2                  | 6            |
|         | IWS 2. Business approach requirements for training process organization. Original essay with conclusions and list of references no less than 3 pages. Anti-plagiarism check of at least 55-60%   |                    | 30           |
| Midterm | control 1  |                    | 100          |
| 8       | L 8. Requirements for the organization and management of the training process.   | 1                  |              |

|          | non-material motivation of lab   |   |     |
|----------|--|---|-----|
|          | PC 8. Reasonableness of application - motivation as a stimulation of quality labor. Material and<br>non-material motivation of labor: positive and negative examples of motivation and<br>IWST 4. Consults of the statement of the stat | 2 | 6   |
|          | IWST 4 Consultation  |   |     |
| 9        | L 9. Target benchmarks and feedback on results IWS 2<br>for managing the educational process. Compliance requirements composite atti-<br>reputation of the educational process. Compliance requirements composite atti-  |   |     |
|          | for managing the educational process. Compliance requirements, corporate ethics and<br>reputation of the educational matitution. Discipling fulfillment of teniors ethics and<br>PC 9. What much   |   |     |
|          | reputation of the educational process. Compliance requirements   | 1 |     |
|          | reputation of the educational process. Compliance requirements, corporate ethics and PC 9. What methods are used to meet the benchmarks and for training process.  |   |     |
|          | PC 9. What methods are used to meet the benchmarks and form professional competencies?<br>Human values, teacher's values, learner's values - a field for injut growth and interval   |   |     |
|          | Human values, teacher's values, learner's values - a field for joint growth and interaction.   | 2 | 6   |
| 10       | IWST 5. Consultations on the implementation of IWS 3   |   |     |
|          | L 10. General issues of the organization of IWS 3<br>current situation. Experience and mistakes. Pedatorical process in relation to the  |   |     |
|          | current situation. Experience and mistakes. Pedagogical control.   | 1 | 1.1 |
|          | PC 10. Curriculum as a joint program of actions of the teacher and students. Knowledge control systems, knowledge assessment system. The main functions of actions and students.   |   |     |
|          | systems, knowledge assessment system. The main functions of control, means of<br>communication, verification of information and force of control, means of   | 2 | 6   |
|          | communication, verification of information and facts.  |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
| 11       | MODULE 3 Scope of applications on the fulfilment of tasks of the 2nd module<br>L 11. Practical applicability of the methodology of cherry of cherry in the second process management   |   |     |
|          | L 11. Practical applicability of the methodology of educational process management in<br>organizations of different directions   |   |     |
|          | organizations of different directions  | 1 |     |
|          | PC 11. Definitions, terminology, and normative references - to meet educational state standards.<br>IWS 3. Pedagogical analysis and corrective descine and the standards.  | 2 |     |
|          | IWS 3. Pedagogical analysis and corrective decision-making - as part of the process of learning<br>control. Project work on the analysis of a specific analysis of a specific analysis.  | 2 | 6   |
|          | control. Project work on the analysis of a specific case, designed in the form of a report for<br>performance - presentation of at least 7 clicke.   |   | 50  |
| 12       | performance - presentation of at least 7 slides  |   |     |
| 12       | L12. Pedagogical monitoring - functionality. Types, system, technology<br>PC 12. Direction of melana in functionality.   | 1 | -   |
|          |  | 2 | 6   |
|          |  | - | 0   |
| 13       | 1 THOR J. CONSUMPTIONS and recuback on results INVCT 2   |   | 2   |
| 15       | L 13. Principles of business approach in educational process management: analysis, goal-   | 1 | -   |
|          | setting, planning, decision-making, organization and control, motivation and delegation,<br>marketing  |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
|          | PC 13. What visual, demonstration and technical methods - contribute to the realization of the<br>learning process in the subject "Biology"  | 2 | 6   |
|          | IWST 6. Consultation on exam preparation   |   |     |
| 14       | L 14. Innovative approaches applicable to the learning management process.   |   | 2   |
|          | PC 14 Innovative approaches applied by the learning management process.  | 1 |     |
|          | PC 14. Innovative approaches applicable to improve the organization of the learning process -<br>models of the future. Pedagogical analysis and quality centrol  | 2 | 6   |
| 15       | L 15. Diversity and flexibility of formats, training models - as a basis for the development   |   |     |
|          | of learning process management methodology. Pedagogical marketing, Tasks of marketing  | 1 |     |
|          | in the educational process. Marketing tools.   |   |     |
|          | PC 15. Best practices and models for managing the educational process. List marketing  |   | _   |
|          | strategies for the educational process, tools for researching consumer needs and demands,  | 2 | 6   |
|          | analyzing the target audience.   |   |     |
| Midter   | m control 2  |   |     |
| Final co | ontrol (exam)  |   | 100 |
| TOTAL    | for course   |   | 100 |
|          | A DALAN SARAN AND  |   | 100 |
|          |  |   |     |
|          | ESA HUBRET WA LEES   |   |     |
|          | Dean Jack Evoternonorua  |   |     |
|          | ΦΑΚΧΩΤΕΤΙ  |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
|          | Head of Departme   |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
|          | Lecturer Tormanova A N   |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |
|          |  |   |     |

#### RUBRICATOR OF THE SUMMATIVE ASSESSMENT

## **CRITERIA EVALUATION OF LEARNING OUTCOMES**

Issued at the request of the teacher for each planned summative assessment (IWST)

## TEMPLATE

Task name (points, % content from 100% MC, copy from the calendar (graphics) implementation of the content of the training course, methods of teaching and learning

|  | ''Excellent''<br>Max. weight in % | <br> | ''Unsatisfactory''<br>Max. weight in % |
|--|-----------------------------------|------|--|
|  |                                   | <br> | U                                      |

| Criterion   | <b>"Excellent"</b><br>20-25%  | "Good"<br>15-20%  | "Satisfactory"<br>10-15%  | "Unsatisfactory"<br>0-10%   |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Understanding Theories<br>and concepts of professional<br>identity and professionalism of<br>a teacher<br>Awareness of key issues of<br>professional identity and<br>professionalism of teachers in<br>Kazakhstan | Deep understanding of theories,<br>concepts of professional identity<br>and teacher professionalism.<br>Relevant and relevant links<br>(citations) to key sources are<br>provided.<br>Links well the key concepts of<br>professional identity and teacher<br>professionalism with the context<br>of Kazakhstan. Excellent<br>substantiation of arguments with | Understanding theories,<br>concepts of professional identity<br>and teacher professionalism.<br>Links (citations) to key sources<br>are provided.<br>Links the concepts of<br>professional identity and teacher<br>professionalism with the context<br>of Kazakhstan. Supports<br>arguments with evidence from<br>empirical research. | Limited understanding of theories,<br>concepts of professional identity and<br>teacher professionalism. Limited<br>references (citations) to key sources are<br>provided.<br>Limited connection of the concepts of<br>professional identity and professionalism | Superficial understanding / lack of<br>understanding of theories, concepts of<br>professional identity and professionalism<br>of the teacher.<br>Relevant references (citations) to key<br>sources are not provided.<br>There is little or no connection between<br>the concepts of a teacher's professional<br>identity and the context of Kazakhstan. |
| Policy proposal or practical<br>recommendations/suggestions<br>Letter,<br>APA style   | Offers sound policy and/or<br>practical recommendations,<br>proposals for improving the<br>professional identity and<br>professionalism of teachers in<br>Kazakhstan.<br>The writing demonstrates clarity,<br>conciseness and correctness.<br>Strictly follows the APA style.   | Offers some policy and/or<br>practical recommendations,<br>proposals for enhancing the<br>professional identity and<br>professionalism of teachers in<br>Kazakhstan<br>The letter demonstrates clarity,<br>conciseness and correctness.<br>Basically follows the APA<br>style.  | non-essential, not based on rigorous<br>analysis, and are shallow.<br>The letter has some key errors and clarity<br>needs to be improved. There are mistakes  | Little or no policy and practice advice,<br>or advice of very low quality.<br>The writing is unclear, it is difficult to<br>follow the content. Lots of mistakes in<br>following the APA style.   |

# **Example 1.** Written assignment "My professional history" (25% of 100% MC)

## **Example 2.** Group presentation "Teaching profession in Kazakhstan" (30% of 100% RK)

| Criterion                       | "Excellent"                             | "Good"                               | "Satisfactory"                           | "Unsatisfactory"                             |
|---------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--|--|
|                                 | 25-30%                                  | 20-20%                               | 15-20%                                   | 0 - 15%                                      |
| Understanding theories and      | Deep understanding of theories,         | Understanding theories, concepts of  |  | Superficial understanding / lack of          |
| concepts of the professional    |   |                                      |  | understanding of theories, concepts of the   |
| identity of the teacher and the | of the teacher and the teaching         | teacher and the teaching             | the teacher and the teaching             | professional identity of the teacher and the |
| teaching profession             | profession.                             | profession.                          | profession.                              | teaching profession.                         |
| Awareness of key issues of the  | Competent correlation of the key        | There is a connection between the    | Limited correlation of the professional  | Insignificant connection / lack of           |
| professional identity of the    | concepts of the professional identity   | concepts of professional identity of | identity of the teacher and the concepts | connection between the concepts of the       |
| teacher and the teaching        | of the teacher and the teaching         | a teacher and the teaching           | of the teaching profession with the      | teacher's professional identity and the      |
| 1                               | L                                       | L                                    | context of Kazakhstan. Limited use of    | context of Kazakhstan. Little or no          |
|                                 | Kazakhstan. Excellent substantiation    |                                      | evidence from empirical research         | empirical research is used.                  |
|                                 | 0                                       | backed by evidence from empirical    |  |  |
|                                 | 1 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | research.                            |  |  |
|                                 | based on interviews or statistical      |                                      |  |  |
|                                 | analysis).                              |                                      |  |  |
| Pilot Study                     |   |                                      |  | Poor use of the results of pilot studies     |
|                                 | studies (interviews or surveys) in the  | studies (interviews or surveys) in   | studies (interviews or surveys) in the   | (interviews or surveys) in the presentation. |
|                                 |   |                                      | presentation.                            |  |
| Suggestion of policy or         |   | Offers some policy and/or practical  |  | Little or no policy and practice advice, or  |
| -                               |   | 20                                   |  | advice of very low quality.                  |
|                                 |   |                                      | are non-essential, not based on rigorous |  |
|                                 | • •                                     |                                      | analysis, and are shallow.               |  |
|                                 |   | Kazakhstan.                          |  |  |
| Presentation,                   |   |                                      | Satisfactory level of involvement,       | Low engagement, low quality content,         |
| teamwork                        |   |                                      | J 1                                      | poor teamwork.                               |
|                                 | materials, excellent teamwork.          | good teamwork.                       | satisfactory level of teamwork.          |  |